Case 1:17-cr-00350-KBF Document 724 Filed 04/25/18 Page 1 of 22

	I4K3MAKP P1	Lea
1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COUP SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YO	DRK
2		x
3	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	
4	V.	17 CR 350 (KBF)
5	LEVAN MAKASHVILI,	
6	Defendant.	
7		x
8		New York, N.Y.
9		April 20, 2018 2:30 p.m.
10		
11	Before:	
12	HON.	ONA T. WANG,
13		Magistrate Judge
14	I I	APPEARANCES
15	GEOFFREY S. BERMAN	
16	Interim United States Southern District of N ANDREW C. ADAMS	-
17	Assistant United State	es Attorney
18	XAVIER R. DONALDSON	
19	Attorney for Defendant	
20	ALSO PRESENT: Maya Beridze	Special Agent Robert Hanratty, FBI
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(Defendant's responses are in English unless otherwise noted)

THE DEPUTY CLERK: United States v. Makashvili, 17 CR 350. Counsel, please state your appearances for the record.

MR. ADAMS: Good afternoon, your Honor. Andrew Adams for the United States, and with me at counsel table is Special Agent Robert Hanratty of the FBI.

MR. DONALDSON: For Mr. Makashvili, Xavier R. Donaldson, good afternoon. Good afternoon Mr. Adams, good afternoon, law enforcement.

THE COURT: Good afternoon. I am Magistrate Judge Wanq.

Mr. Makashvili, are you able to hear and understand what the interpreter is telling you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: I have before me a consent to proceed before a United States magistrate judge on a felony plea allocution that you have signed. What this form says is that, knowing you have the right to have this plea taken by a United States district judge, you're agreeing to have the plea taken by a United States magistrate judge. As a magistrate judge, I have the authority to take your plea with your consent, and you would still be entitled to all of the same rights and protections as if you were before a district judge. Among other things, if you're found guilty, you will be sentenced by

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

a district judge.

Did you sign the consent to proceed before a United States magistrate judge voluntarily?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Before you signed the form, did your lawyer explain it to you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you wish to proceed with your plea before a United States magistrate judge?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Your consent is accepted.

The purpose of this proceeding is to make sure that you understand your rights, to decide whether you're pleading quilty of your own free will, and to make sure that you are pleading guilty because you are guilty and not for some other reason.

Do you understand that?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: If at any time you don't understand any of my questions, or if you wish to consult with your attorney, just say so. Because it is important that you understand every question before you answer.

Before I take your plea, I must ask you a series of questions and I therefore need to place you under oath. Please raise your right hand.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(Defendant sworn)

THE COURT: Mr. Makashvili, do you understand that any statements you make here today under oath may be used against you in a prosecution for perjury or for making false statements if you do not tell the truth?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Did you sign this waiver of indictment?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Before you signed it, did you discuss it with your attorney?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand what you are doing?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that you are under no obligation to waive indictment?

THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry, your Honor. Could you repeat it, please?

THE COURT: Do you understand that you are under no obligation to waive indictment?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that if you do not waive indictment, if the government wants to prosecute you, they would have to present this case to a grand jury, which may or may not indict you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

KP Plea

1	THE COURT: Do you realize that by signing this waiver
2	of indictment, you have given up your right to have this case
3	presented to a grand jury?
4	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
5	THE COURT: Do you understand what a grand jury is?
6	THE INTERPRETER: This is the interpreter. I don't
7	think he knows.
8	(Defendant conferring with his counsel)
9	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
10	THE COURT: Have you seen a copy of the information?
11	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
12	THE COURT: Was it read or translated for you?
13	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
14	THE COURT: Do you waive its public reading?
15	THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry waive what?
16	THE COURT: "Waive" meaning to give up.
17	THE INTERPRETER: So it means he lose the right?
18	MR. DONALDSON: Does he want it read out loud.
19	THE INTERPRETER: Thank you very much.
20	THE DEFENDANT: No.
21	THE COURT: Wait. You want me to read it publicly?
22	MR. DONALDSON: No. No, we do not.
23	THE COURT: Okay.
24	MR. DONALDSON: He said no.
25	THE DEFENDANT: No.

	I4K3MAKP	Plea
1		THE COURT: He waives the public reading then?
2		MR. DONALDSON: Yes.
3		THE COURT: Yes, okay.
4		How do you plead to the information, guilty or not
5	guilty?	
6		THE DEFENDANT: I plead guilty.
7		THE COURT: Tell me your full name.
8		THE DEFENDANT: Levan Makashvili.
9		THE COURT: What is your age?
10		THE DEFENDANT: 29.
11		THE COURT: Are you a citizen of the United States?
12		I need a verbal answer.
13		THE DEFENDANT: No.
14		THE COURT: What country are you a citizen of?
15		THE DEFENDANT: Georgia.
16		THE COURT: Are you able to read and write in English?
17		THE DEFENDANT: A bit.
18		THE COURT: What is your native language?
19		THE DEFENDANT: Levan.
20		Georgian.
21		THE COURT: Are you able to read and write in
22	Georgian	?
23		THE DEFENDANT: Yes, yes.
24		THE COURT: How far did you go in school?
25		THE DEFENDANT: (Through the interpreter) I went to

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

college, I graduated from college, and I graduated from high school, too.

THE COURT: Are you now or have you recently been under the care of a doctor or a psychiatrist for any reason? THE DEFENDANT: No.

THE COURT: Have you been treated recently for any mental illness or addiction to narcotic drugs of any kind?

THE DEFENDANT: I never smoke, never drink, never nothing. I'm a fighter.

THE COURT: As you sit here today, are you under the influence of any mind-altering drug or any alcoholic drink?

THE DEFENDANT: Never, never. No.

THE COURT: Have you been able to understand everything I have said to you so far?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you feel all right today?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: You have seen a copy of the information in this case, right?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: I think we've been through this, but you've read it and it's been translated for you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand what it says that you

25 did?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Plea

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Have you had a chance to discuss the charges and how you wish to plead with your attorney?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Are you satisfied with your attorney's representation of you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Have you had a full opportunity to discuss this case with him?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Has he told you the consequences of pleading guilty?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Are you ready to enter a plea?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Count One of the information charges that you, Mr. Makashvili, with interstate travel to facilitate an unlicensed gambling business.

How do you wish to plead, guilty or not guilty?

THE DEFENDANT: Guilty.

THE COURT: Okay. With respect to Count One of the information, I want you to understand that the maximum penalty is a prison term of five years, a maximum term of supervised release of three years, a maximum fine of the greatest of \$250,000.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry, your Honor. He asked something. I missed what you say.

THE COURT: I'm sorry.

THE INTERPRETER: So could you repeat it, please?

THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to run through a list of the maximum penalties that may be assessed in connection with a quilty plea to this crime. That is the maximum sentence that a Court could impose by law.

MR. DONALDSON: Could we just have one second.

(Defendant conferring with his counsel)

MR. DONALDSON: Sorry, Judge. Go ahead.

THE COURT: Everything all right?

MR. DONALDSON: Yes.

THE COURT: Okay. Okay. So, I'm going to start over again and I'm going to list the maximum penalties, because I want to make sure that you are aware of them and that I didn't miss any of them.

So again, with respect to Count One of the information, I want you to understand that the maximum penalty of imprisonment is five years, the maximum term of supervised release is three years. There is a maximum fine of the greatest of \$250,000 or twice the gross pecuniary gain derived from the offense --

THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry, I don't understand. does it mean?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: Twice the gross pecuniary gain. So twice the monetary gain.

THE INTERPRETER: Ah, okay. Thank you.

THE COURT: Or twice the gross pecuniary loss to persons other than the defendant, and a \$100 mandatory special assessment. In addition, the Court must order restitution to any victims.

Do you understand these maximum penalties that I've just described to you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you also understand that if, as part of your sentence, you are placed on a term of supervised release and then you violated any of the conditions of that release, you could face an additional term of imprisonment?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: The district judge can revoke the term of release previously imposed, and return you to prison without giving you any credit for time previously served.

THE DEFENDANT: I understand.

THE COURT: You would not get any credit for time previously served on post-release supervision.

If you're not a United States citizen, do you understand that your quilty plea may result in your being removed from the United States, denied citizenship, and denied admission to the United States in the future?

1 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that you're bound by your guilty plea regardless of the immigration consequences of your plea and regardless of any advice that you may have received from your counsel or others regarding those consequences?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Have you specifically discussed the immigration consequences with your attorney?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: I'm now going to explain certain

Constitutional rights that you have. These are rights that you will be giving up if you enter a guilty plea. Please listen carefully to what I'm about to say, and if you do not understand something, stop me, and your attorney and I will explain the issue more fully.

Do you understand that you have a right to plead not quilty?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Or if you have already so pleaded, to persist in that plea, and a right to a speedy and public jury trial if you wish -- yes?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that if you plead not guilty and go to trial, you would be presumed innocent, and the

T4K3MAKP

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

burden would be on the government to prove your guilt beyond a reasonable doubt?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: That means that you would not have to prove you were innocent, and you could not be convicted unless a jury of 12 people unanimously agreed that you were quilty beyond a reasonable doubt.

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that you would be entitled to be represented by an attorney at all stages at trial, and at every other stage of the proceedings. And if you could not afford to hire one, an attorney would be provided to you by the Court for free.

Do you understand that at such a trial, you would be entitled to confront and cross-examine any witnesses called by the government to testify against you, that you would be entitled to testify on your own behalf, that you could call witnesses and present evidence, and that the Court would issue subpoenas at your request to compel witnesses to appear and testify in your defense even if they didn't want to come?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Please keep your voice up if you're going to say "yes," or let the interpreter know.

Do you understand that at a trial you would not be required to testify against yourself?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: If you chose not to testify, that could not be used against you.

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that if you were convicted at a trial, you have a right to appeal that verdict to a higher court?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that if you enter a quilty plea, you give up all of these rights, including your right to a trial, that you will not be able to withdraw this plea --

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: -- and that the only remaining step in this case will be the sentencing?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that the decision as to the appropriate sentence in your case will be entirely up to the sentencing judge, and that she will be limited only by what the law requires?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you understand that even if you are surprised or disappointed by your sentence, you will still be bound by your quilty plea?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

T4K3MAKP Plea THE COURT: Finally, if you do plead guilty, you're 1 also giving up your right not to incriminate yourself. 2 3 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 4 THE COURT: And I will ask you questions about what 5 you did in order to satisfy myself that you are actually 6 quilty. 7 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. THE COURT: By pleading guilty, you will be admitting 8 9 your factual as well as your legal guilt. Do you understand 10 that? 11 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 12 THE COURT: Knowing all this, do you still wish to 13 plead quilty to Count One of the information? 14 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 15 THE COURT: Have any force or threats been used, either direct or indirect, to influence how you plead today? 16 17 THE DEFENDANT: No. 18 THE COURT: I have before me a letter dated April 12, 19 2018, from the U.S. attorney to your attorney containing a plea 20 agreement. Has this letter been translated for you? 21 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 22 THE COURT: Did you sign it on the last page? 23 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

with your attorney?

Before you signed it, did you discuss it

THE COURT:

24

25

1 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. THE COURT: Did he explain to you all its terms and 2 3 conditions? 4 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 5 THE COURT: Apart from what is contained in this letter, have any promises been made to you in order to get you 6 7 to plead quilty? 8 THE DEFENDANT: No. 9 THE COURT: In reviewing the plea agreement, I note 10 that it contains an analysis of how a part of our law of 11 sentencing known as the sentencing quidelines may impact on any 12 prison term in your case. 13 Based on that analysis, the agreement states the 14 conclusion that the guideline sentencing range can be expected 15 to be from zero to six months. 16 Do you understand that? 17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 18 THE COURT: Do you understand that the sentencing judge is not bound by the calculation in the letter, and that 19 20 she will be free to do her own calculation, which may result in 21 a guideline range that is different from the one in the letter? 2.2 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 23 THE COURT: Do you understand that no matter what the

sentencing range the sentencing judge believes is called for by

the guidelines, that range is just one of many factors that the

24

25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

judge will consider in determining your sentence, and that the judge has discretion to give you a prison sentence below or above the range, anywhere up to the maximum sentence of imprisonment of five years?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you also understand that under the terms of this plea agreement, if the judge sentences you to a prison term that is six months or less, you're giving up your right to appeal that sentence or to challenge it in any other way?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Also do you understand that the plea agreement says you cannot appeal any fine of \$20,000 or less, and that you cannot appeal any lawful sentence of supervised release?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Do you also understand that in this letter you're giving up your right to complain if the government withheld evidence from your attorney that would have been helpful to you?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Is your plea voluntary; that is, made of your own free will?

> THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Have any threats been made to influence

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

how you plead today?

THE DEFENDANT: No.

THE COURT: Did you in fact commit the offense that is charged in Count One of the information?

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

THE COURT: Before I ask you to tell me what you did, I'll ask the government to summarize the elements of the offense, and if they wish, to tell me any evidence that they would have offered at trial.

MR. ADAMS: Thank you, your Honor. There are three elements with respect to the single charge in this information. The first is that the defendant traveled interstate; second, that the travel was done with the intent to promote, manage, establish or carry on an unlawful activity, which is a defined term in the statute; and third, that after the interstate travel, the defendant performed or attempted to perform an act in furtherance of the same unlawful activity. And here the unlawful activity in question is a violation of 18, U.S.C. Section 1955, which prohibits the operation of unlawful gambling businesses.

With respect to proof at trial, were the government to proceed, the proof would include surveillance performed by agents of the FBI with respect to Mr. Makashvili and others involved in the unlawful gambling business, ledgers and documentation from the unlawful gambling business itself,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

geolocation data related to cellular telephones belonging to various members of the conspiracy relating to the unlawful gambling business, and the testimony of several cooperating witnesses and confidential sources, including with respect to Mr. Makashvili's role.

THE COURT: How would the government show that venue lies in the Southern District of New York?

MR. ADAMS: The venue with respect to the specific charge included travel through the Southern District of New York, specifically from New Jersey into Brooklyn through the Southern District.

> THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Makashvili, can you please tell me in your own words what you did that makes you guilty of the charges against you.

MR. DONALDSON: So, your Honor, with the Court's permission, Mr. Makashvili and myself have put together a -authored an allocution for him to read. It is in English. So he can't read it in English. So, we've had the interpreter read it verbatim to Mr. Makashvili on several occasions.

So what I would like to do is read it in English, and then the court reporter can get it, and the interpreter will be interpreting what I'm reading to Mr. Makashvili, and then we can ask Mr. Makashvili whether he in fact admits to or agrees to or if that's his statement.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: Does the government have any objection to that process?

> No, your Honor. Thank you. MR. ADAMS:

THE COURT: Please proceed.

MR. DONALDSON: Thank you.

"I, Levan Makashvili, on or about May of 2016, was aware of an unlawful gambling enterprise at the Poker House in Brooklyn, New York, which was made up of more than five people, was in existence for more than 30 days, and was operating in Brooklyn, New York, and elsewhere.

"On or about May 2016, I knowingly and unlawfully traveled from Brooklyn, New York, to New Jersey through Manhattan and back to Brooklyn for the purpose of assisting members of the unlawful gambling enterprise promote their gambling activities in Brooklyn. I drove them from Brooklyn to New Jersey and then back to Brooklyn.

"Once back in Brooklyn, I drove a member of the unlawful gambling enterprise to a meeting at the Poker House so that he could continue working on the group's unlawful gambling activities. I knew what I was doing was unlawful."

THE COURT: Mr. Makashvili, your counsel has just read in English a statement that he represents was prepared with your assistance, and that the interpreter has translated for you now.

I wanted to ask you if the statements that your

I4K3MAKP Plea counsel just read into the record were exact and correct. 1 2 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 3 THE COURT: And did you really do the things that Mr. Donaldson read in English? 4 5 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 6 THE COURT: Does the government represent that it has 7 sufficient evidence to establish Mr. Makashvili's quilt beyond a reasonable doubt? 8 9 MR. ADAMS: Yes, your Honor. 10 THE COURT: Mr. Donaldson, do you know of any defense 11 that would prevail at trial or other reason why your client 12 should not be permitted to plead guilty? 13 MR. DONALDSON: I do not. 14 THE COURT: Do you have any doubt as to 15 Mr. Makashvili's competence to plead at this time? MR. DONALDSON: I have no doubt about that. 16 17 THE COURT: And Mr. Makashvili, did you know that what 18 you were doing was against the law? 19 THE DEFENDANT: Yes. 20 THE COURT: Any further questions either side wants me 21 to ask? 22 MR. ADAMS: No, your Honor. Thank you.

THE COURT: Is there any reason why I should not recommend that the district judge accept this plea?

MR. DONALDSON:

23

24

25

No, your Honor. Thank you.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. ADAMS: No, your Honor.

MR. DONALDSON: No, your Honor.

THE COURT: On the basis of the defendant's responses to my questions and my observations of his demeanor, I find that he's fully competent to enter an informed plea at this time. I also conclude that he understands the nature of the charges and the consequences of the plea.

THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

of the information be accepted.

THE COURT: Finally, I'm satisfied that his plea is voluntary and that there is a factual basis for it.

Accordingly, I recommend that the proffered plea to Count One

I assume the government will order a copy of the transcript and will submit it to Judge Forrest.

MR. ADAMS: Yes, your Honor.

THE COURT: Together with any additional paperwork so that she may act on my recommendation.

A presentence investigation report is ordered.

Is there a sentencing date set yet?

MR. ADAMS: There is not, your Honor. We would ask for a control date approximately 90 days out.

THE COURT: Okay. That would be July 20. The prosecution case summary for purposes of the presentence report is to be delivered to the probation department no later than 14 days from today.

1 MR. DONALDSON: Excuse me. 2 THE COURT: Just a moment, okay. 3 (Pause) 4 MR. DONALDSON: Judge, with the government's 5 permission, can we have August 1st as the control date? additional weeks. 6 7 THE COURT: And the government has no objection? 8 MR. ADAMS: No, your Honor. 9 THE COURT: Control date is now August 1st, 2018. 10 The prosecution case summary for purposes of the 11 presentence report is to be delivered to the probation department no later than 14 days from today. Mr. Donaldson, 12 13 you should make yourself available to be interviewed by the 14 probation department with your client no later than 14 days 15 from today. 16 Is there anything further on this matter from either 17 side? 18 MR. ADAMS: Nothing from the government, your Honor. 19 MR. DONALDSON: No, your Honor. Thank you. 20 THE COURT: Thank you. This matter is adjourned. 21 (Adjourned) 22 23 24 25